

**CIVIL PROCEEDINGS — U.S. DISTRICT COURT, EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA, RICHMOND DIVISION**  
**NON-JURY TRIAL OR MOTION HEARING MINUTE SHEET**

---

JUDGE: **ROBERT E. PAYNE, ARENDA ALLEN, BARABRA KEENAN**

DOCKET NO. **3:14-CV-852**

REPORTER: **PEPPY PETERSON, OCR**

DATE: **JANUARY 10, 2019**

Case Style: **GOLDEN BETHUNE-HILL, et al v. VIRGINIA STATE BOARD OF ELECTIONS, et al.**

Counsel for Plaintiff(s): **JAMES SNYDER, KEVIN HAMILTON**

Counsel for Defendant(s): **TOBY HEYTENS, STEPHEN COBB, MICHELLE KALLEN**

Counsel for Intervenor Defendant(s): **KATHERINE MCKNIGHT, DALTON OLDHAM, JR., MARK BRADEN, RICHARD RAILE**

Counsel for Interested Party (Virginia State Conference of NAACP Branches): **DAVID PRINCE, ALLISON RIGGS, JEFF LOPERFIDO**

Special Master: **DR. BERNARD GROFMAN**

---

Matter Comes on For: ( ) BENCH TRIAL  
( ) MOTION HEARING  
( ☒ ) OTHER: **HEARING REGARDING DR. BERNARD GROFMAN'S PROPOSAL**

Appearances: PARTIES BY COUNSEL ( ☒ ) / WITH COUNSEL ( ) PRO SE ( )

Motions before Trial: \_\_\_\_\_

**TRIAL PROCEEDINGS:**

WITNESSES EXCLUDED ON MOTION OF: PLAINTIFF(S) ( ) DEFENDANT(S) ( ) COURT ( )

OPENING STATEMENTS MADE ( ) OPENING WAIVED ( )

PLAINTIFF(S) ADDUCED EVIDENCE ( ) RESTED ( ) MOTION ( ) \_\_\_\_\_

DEFENDANT(S) ADDUCED EVIDENCE ( ) RESTED ( ) MOTION ( ) \_\_\_\_\_

REBUTTAL EVIDENCE ADDUCED ( ) SUR-REBUTTAL EVIDENCE ADDUCED ( )

EVIDENCE CONCLUDED ( ) ARGUMENTS OF COUNSEL HEARD ( )

COURT FOUND IN FAVOR OF PLAINTIFF(S) ( ) MONETARY AWARD \$ \_\_\_\_\_

COURT FOUND IN FAVOR OF DEFENDANT(S) ( ) \_\_\_\_\_

CLERK TO ENTER JUDGMENT ON DECISION ( ) TRIAL EXHIBITS RETURNED TO COUNSEL ( )

**ADDITIONAL NOTATIONS:**

**TESTIMONY OF DR. BERNARD GROFMAN (DIRECT – INTERVENOR DEFENDANT 9:39 AM-11:06 AM, 11:27 AM-11:52 AM; CROSS – PLAINTIFF 11:53 AM-12:04 PM); ARGUMENTS HEARD (PLAINTIFF 12:08 PM-12:27 PM, INTERESTED PARTY 12:27 PM-1:08 PM, INTERVENOR DEFENDANT 2:14 PM-3:14 PM, DEFENDANT 3:15 PM-3:27 PM, PLAINTIFF 3:28 PM-3:34 PM); MOTION FOR ATTORNEY FEES AND LITIGATION EXPENSES (ECF 240) DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE, TO REFILE AT LATER DATE; DR. GROFMAN TO SUBMIT COMPLETE REPORT IN PUBLICATION QUALITY ADDRESSING ALL CORRECTIONS TO INCLUDE ADDENDA IN ONE WEEK**

SET: **9:30 A.M.** BEGAN: **9:38 A.M.** ENDED: **3:42 P.M.** TIME IN COURT: **4 HRS. 41 MINS.**

RECESSES: **11:06 A.M. – 11:26 A.M.; 1:09 P.M. – 2:12 P.M.**